

Mark A. Keffer Law & Government Affairs

Vice President Atlantic Region

Room 3-D 3033 Chain Bridge Road Oakton, VA 22185 703 691-6046 FAX 703 691-6093 Email Fax No. 202 263-2692 mkeffer@att.com

January 13, 2003

## **VIA HAND-DELIVERY**

Sanford M. Speight, Acting Secretary **Public Service Commission** of the District of Columbia 1333 H Street, N.W. 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, West Tower Washington, DC 20005

Re:

Formal Case No. 962 and Formal Case No. 1011

Dear Mr. Speight:

Please find enclosed an original and fifteen copies of AT&T Communications of Washington, D.C. L.L.C.'s letter to Verizon regarding its December 18, 2002 notice to CLECs operating in the District of Columbia addressing UNE rates that Verizon intends to charge.

Very truly yours,

Mark A. Keffer

**Enclosures** 

cc: Service List



Mark A. Keffer
Law & Government Affairs
Vice President
Atlantic Region

Room 3-D 3033 Chain Bridge Road Oakton, VA 22185 703 691-6046 FAX 703 691-6093 Email Fax No. 202 263-2692 mkeffer@att.com

January 13, 2003

## BY FACSIMILE

Mr. John C. Peterson Director-Contract Performance and Administration Verizon Wholesale Markets 600 Hidden Ridge – HQEWMNOTICES Irving, TX 75038

Re: DC Formal Case No. 962 and Formal Case No. 1011

Dear Mr. Peterson:

AT&T is aware of Verizon DC's notice to CLECs operating in the District of Columbia of Verizon's intention to begin charging UNE rates which are somewhat lower than the "FCC proxy" rates Verizon DC has had in place since 1996. The new UNE rates Verizon proposes to charge (herein, the "New York Benchmark rates"), are substantially higher than UNE rates prescribed as just and reasonable by the Public Service Commission of the District of Columbia on December 6, 2002, by Order No. 12610 in Formal Case 962. Verizon has filed a petition asking the PSC to reconsider those rates. By operation of District law, Verizon's petition for reconsideration has resulted in an automatic stay of the PSC-approved new rates.

Verizon's December 18, 2002 notice asserts that any CLEC that pays a bill reflecting Verizon's slightly-reduced "New York Benchmark" UNE rates will thereby implicitly consent to amend its interconnection agreement with Verizon to accept the "New York Benchmark" UNE rates until such time as the DC PSC issues its ruling on reconsideration. AT&T believes that the rate changes set forth in Verizon's notice are both illegal (because they are unauthorized by the PSC) and unlawful (because the changed rates are still far above the levels prescribed as just and reasonable by the PSC). Moreover, Verizon has no legal authority for unilaterally decreeing that a CLEC's payment of a Verizon invoice *ipso facto* constitutes acceptance of a change in the parties' interconnection agreement. Interconnection agreements are modified in the same manner that they are made – by written agreements executed by both parties.

What Verizon is attempting to do here is an obvious attempt to circumvent the intent of the DC PSC. The PSC's recent orders have given Verizon two clear choices: (1) implement the UNE rate reductions prescribed by the PSC on December 6, 2002,



subject to the PSC's review on reconsideration, or (2) allow Verizon's inflated and unlawful 1996 FCC proxy rates to remain in effect, with the consequence that the PSC will not support Verizon's 271 application. By contriving CLEC "consent" to Verizon's unilateral implementation of "New York benchmark" rates, Verizon seeks to limit its rate reductions to only those amounts calculated to win FCC approval of Verizon's 271 application, while continuing its scorched earth litigation tactics against the rate reductions prescribed by the PSC. The PSC made clear in its January 6 order, however, that Verizon's proposed "New York Benchmark" rates are both illegal and unlawful. The fake consent that Verizon now seeks to bootstrap from the CLECs is as illegitimate as the rates themselves.

To avoid any ambiguity on this issue, AT&T and its subsidiaries hereby notify Verizon that they expressly reject Verizon's proposal that AT&T and its subsidiaries agree to pay the "New York Benchmark" rates and agree to any amendment, implicit or otherwise, to the interconnection agreements between Verizon and AT&T and its affiliates. If Verizon unilaterally reduces the UNE rates it charges AT&T and its affiliates to the levels of the "New York Benchmark" rates, AT&T will view those rates as a unilateral amendment in AT&T's UNE rates, equivalent to a gift for which AT&T has provided no consideration.

Respectfully submitted,

AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF WASHINGTON, D.C., LLC

By Its Attorneys

Mark A. Keffer Michael A. McRae

3033 Chain Bridge Road, 3D

Oakton, Virginia 22185

CC:

Natalie O. Ludaway, Esq. David A. Hill, Esq. Steve Sisk Certificated CLECs in DC

## Certificate of Service Formal Case No. 962

I hereby certify that a copy of AT&T Communications of the Washington, DC L.L.C.'s letter to Verizon regarding its December 18, 2002 notice to CLECs was mailed first-class U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, to the following parties this 13th day of January 2003.

J. Henry Ambrose Verizon Washington, D.C., Inc. 1710 H Street, N.W. 11<sup>th</sup> Floor Washington, DC 20006

Edward Donohue Counsel for XO DC, Inc. Cole, Raywid & Braverman, L.L.P. 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006

Craig D. Dingwall
Director, State Regulatory/Northeast
Sprint Communications Co. L.P.
401 9<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, Suite 400
Washington, DC 20004
Voice (202) 585-1936
Fax (202) 585-1894

Catherine Kane Ronis, Esq. Wilmer, Cutler & Pickering, LLP 2445 M Street, NW Washington, DC 20037 Voice (202) 663-6380

Ross A. Buntrock Counsel for E.Spire Communications, Inc. Kelley Drye & Warren, LLC 1200 19<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. Suite 500 Washington, DC 20036 Natalie O. Ludaway, Esq. Counsel for Verizon Washington, DC Leftwich & Douglas, P.L.L.C. 1401 New York Avenue, N.W. Suite 600 Washington, DC 20005

Elizabeth A. Noel, Esq. Sandra Mattavous-Frye, Esq. Office of People's Counsel 1133 15<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. Suite 500 Washington, DC 20005

Robin F. Cohn, Esq.
Counsel for Starpower Communications
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP
3000 K Street, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20007-5116

Cherie R. Kiser
Counsel for Intermedia Communications
Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris, Glovsky and
Popeo, P.C.
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
9<sup>th</sup> Floor
Washington, DC 20004

Andrew M. Klein John S. Ramsey Kelley Drye & Warren LLP 1200 19<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. Suite 500 Washington, DC 20036 Voice (202) 955-9600 Fax (202) 955-9792 Joseph O. Kahl Director Residential Communications Network, Inc. 105 Carnegie Center Princeton, NJ 08540

Mitchell F. Bercher, Esq. Microwave Services Greenberg & Traurig 800 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20036

Christopher T. McKee Net2000 2180 Fox Mill Road Herndon, VA 20171

Tony Hansel Covad Communications Group Inc. Hamilton Square 600 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 750 Washington, DC 20005 Marc J. Williams, Esq. MCI WorldCom 1133 19<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. 11<sup>th</sup> Floor Washington, DC 20036

David A. Hill, Esq.
Vice President and General Counsel
Verizon Washington, DC Inc.
1710 H Street, N.W.
11<sup>th</sup> Floor
Washington, DC 20006-4601

David M. Janas
Lisa N. Anderson
Christopher R. Bjornson
Counsel for Net2000 Communications of
Virginia, LLC
Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris,
Glovsky and Popeo, P.C.
701 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20004

Gale Smith Kalitsi
Focal Communications Corporation
200 N. LaSalle Street
Suite 1100
Chicago, IL 60601
Voice (312) 895-3601
Fax (312) 895-8403

Danry W. Long